The Early Warning System in Preventing Human Trafficking: Border (In) Security and Challenges for Indonesia

Sy. Hasyim Azizurrahman¹*, Sri Ismawati¹, Parulian Siagian¹, Abunawas Had¹, Muhammad Tahir¹, Sy. Muhammad Ridho Rizki Maulufi Alkadrie²

¹ Faculty of Law, Tanjungpura University, West Kalimantan, Indonesia
² Faculty of Law, Panca Bhakti University, West Kalimantan, Indonesia

Abstract: This article aims to find out how the early warning system is constructed in detecting human trafficking. This research discusses human trafficking in Indonesia, where most of the victims were trafficked to neighboring countries in the border area. One of the unsolved problems exist today is human trafficking in frontier areas; hence, there are three major factors causing the number of human trafficking in Indonesia is in high level according to data from the International Organization for Migration. This article is using empirical legal research method. The results show that the construction of an early warning system can be formed by studying the methods or modes used by the perpetrators in committing the crime of human trafficking. However, for this concept to succeed, good synchronization is needed between filters that include potential victims, agencies or institutions that can represent administrative functions, and officers at border area guard posts.

Keywords: Criminal Law; Crime Prevention; Early Warning System; Human Trafficking; Human Rights

1. Introduction

Efforts to overcome human trafficking crimes that have been carried out so far are futile if not carried out with an evaluation. This is caused because human trafficking crime as a form of crime always develop along with the development of globalization, both from the methods to the impact it causes, so that the government and law enforcement officials must address this problem as a serious problem.¹ The development of human trafficking in Indonesia shows a very worrying impact both from a humanitarian perspective in general and specifically the impact of direct losses on victims. The existence of victims of human trafficking in Indonesia are dominated by women and children who have a high potential for vulnerability.²

---

Women and children are the main focal point in efforts to prevent human trafficking crimes. In von Hentig's typology, women and children are the general class of victims who are seen as weak and gullible. In various countries including Indonesia, women and children have great potential to become victims of human trafficking crimes compared to men or boys, especially in cases of human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation and prostitution. The vulnerable position of women and girls as victims of human trafficking as stated in the forms of manipulation, instrumentalization and exploitation shows that currently the practice of gender discrimination has entered a more developed phase and threatens the position of women and girls.

In fact, the government estimates that 1.9 million out of 4.5 million Indonesian citizens work abroad without official documents. According to IOM 2005-2010, West Kalimantan was ranked second out of the 12 areas with the highest cases of human trafficking, with 722 cases or 19.33 percent, and the latest data from the West Kalimantan Regional Police states that between 2018-2020 there were 14 cases of criminal acts of human trafficking with a total of 122 victims. The state has tried to overcome this problem with various penal policies, namely the establishment of the Law No. 21 of 2007 regarding the Eradication of Human Trafficking Crimes. However, as it turns out into practice, this policy can be said to not work optimally due to developments in human trafficking crimes. Therefore, to support the optimization of criminal policy, another appropriate approach is needed to prevent the occurrence of human trafficking crimes, one of which is by using a non-penal approach, namely by implementing an early warning system.

Previous research has attempted to examine the issue of Human trafficking. This research is more inclined to discuss to legal protection of children who are victims of human trafficking crimes. The findings in this research are that it is necessary to expand the protection of children who are victims of human trafficking crimes so that they are not only limited to compensation or restitution, as well as other studies that examine state responsibility in handling human trafficking crimes. This research focuses on state

---


responsible in handling human trafficking crimes with a penal policy approach with recommendations in the form of material revisions from the Law No. 39 of 2004 regarding the Placement and Protection of Indonesian Migrant Workers Overseas.

Likewise, other studies examine the prevention of human crime in Ethiopia.\textsuperscript{10} This research is inclined to carry out studies related to the prevention of criminal acts of human trafficking with a penal approach. The results of this study only show that the adoption of important aspects of the UN Protocol into the Ethiopian legal framework has had a significant impact and progress in preventing human trafficking. Existing studies do not show the use of the Early Warning System concept as a non-penal approach in the process of preventing human trafficking crimes.

Previous research has attempted to examine the Early Warning System. The early warning system in submitting negative claims for the national health insurance program in hospitals. The study found that the Early Warning System can be used for national health insurance claims if it is carried out using the F.A.S.T method.\textsuperscript{11} Kusworo et al., in 2021 examine the concept of the Early Warning System, which focuses on monitoring the accountability of the Regional Expenditure Budget during a pandemic.\textsuperscript{12} The result of their research indicated that the corruption cases, APIP is an institution that in this case, acts as an early warning system so as to prevent budget mark-ups, it is necessary to strengthen APIP’s capabilities.

None of them discussed the "Early Warning System" in detecting human trafficking crimes. Existing research only shows the prevention of human trafficking crimes as a crime by using a penal approach. On the other hand, this research regarding the implementation of the Early Warning System, does not discuss the application of the Early Warning System in efforts to prevent human trafficking crimes. Therefore, the birth of this research is expected to be able to fill in the gaps that exist as well as contribute to enriching academic horizons and practical solutions for detecting the occurrence of human trafficking crimes so that preventive measures can be taken before the occurrence of human trafficking crimes as crimes that cause victims. In order to fill the above gap, it is hoped that this research will be able to answer the question, namely how is the Construction of an Early Warning System in preventing human trafficking crimes in the border communities of Sambas Regency, West Kalimantan? The question aims to answer what the indicators that can be used as a reference for the early detection of human trafficking crimes and how are the correlation between the indicators in order to form the construction of an early warning system.


2. Method

This research is explorative empirical legal research. There are still not enough references to the theme of the early warning system in efforts to prevent human trafficking crimes; therefore, the authors look for new ideas regarding signs as indicators in warning signs to detect potential human trafficking crimes, especially in the border areas of West Kalimantan, Indonesia. Researchers used primary data collected using interview techniques and purposive sampling. The collected data will then be analyzed using qualitative analysis with a criminological approach.13


Social interaction is a special form of social process which is the key to social life.14 Social interaction is important because social interaction will shape the situation and can even encourage increased awareness. Raising awareness plays an important role in preventing the occurrence of human trafficking crimes through understanding the mode or method used by perpetrators and their impact on victims.15 Human trafficking is connected to contemporary global expansion, which has created more wealth and migration. It is an illegal trade that is a shame to humanity that bruises the body and mind of the victims and almost annihilates them. Due to persistent inequalities in society, girls and women are more vulnerable to this slavery-like practice, which is a consequence of structured gender inequality in the form of violence.16

Terminologically, the term human trafficking comes from English which means illegal trade.17 Its implementation covers many different types and forms, including forced labor, prostitution, sexual exploitation, and so on.18 If related to the concept of interaction above, it can be said that the Crime of Human Trafficking is a form of negative interaction in society that can be classified into organized crime, which generally occurs in border areas in various ways, ranging from taking advantage of personal relationships between perpetrators and border guard officers, taking advantage of the situation of potential victims and so on.19

---

Based on the recapitulation of data obtained from the Office of Women's Empowerment, Child Protection, Population Control and Family Planning in Sambas regency, it is known that during 2015-2020 there were 52 cases (Chart 1).


Theoretically, recruitment is one of the actions in order to find and collect human resources in an organization or company. Recruitment or withdrawal is the process of finding and "luring" qualified candidates to apply for jobs. Based on the results in the field, cases that have been revealed regarding the mode of recruitment of human trafficking crimes, can be seen that in general, in recruiting potential victims, human trafficking perpetrators go to areas in Sambas Regency under the guise of selling their wares in the form of agriculture to second-hand clothes; who then when selling his wares he also made an offer to residents in the area to work in Malaysia with the lure of a high salary of around 500 to 1000 RM when there are potential victims who are interested they will be directed to fellow recruiters for further processing.

On the other hand, based on the deeper exploration of cases that have been uncovered, generally the perpetrators postulate that the motive for recruiting is to help the community or neighbors who want to work in Malaysia, besides that the motive behind the perpetrator's actions is to gain profit. pay all costs related to the departure or departure of the potential victim to Malaysia which will then be reimbursed by the party needing labor, which then the person concerned will get another benefit after being in Malaysia with the victim, namely with an additional profit of around 500 to 2000 RM for distributors given by people who need workers, or parties who will employ potential victims of human trafficking.

---

The results shows that the occurrence of human trafficking crimes in Sambas Regency cannot be separated from acts of coercion and/or deception. In recruiting, perpetrators generally try to convince potential victims by promising high-paying jobs ranging from RM 500 to RM 1000 with relatively easy levels of work such as cashiers, minimarket employees, household assistants, and so on. On the other hand, in cases of prostitution, perpetrators often use coercion in carrying out their duties, this is proven by the field data in the form of interviews with one of the victims, he explained that the perpetrator’s action in inviting the victim was not by promising benefits to the victim, but the perpetrator tried to ask the victim to accompanied him to pick up items in the hotel room occupied by the perpetrator, in this invitation the perpetrator tried to force the victim to follow him by pulling the perpetrator’s hand or dragging the victim to come with the perpetrator.

Last but not least, based on field data, it is known that most of the orientation of the perpetrators of human trafficking crimes in Sambas Regency is with the mode of employment which ultimately led to forced labor. The orientation of this workforce is caused by the main factor, namely the geographical conditions that the position of Sambas Regency and the State of Malaysia very close, which can be reached by land with a relatively short distance. Other factors are poverty, low education, lack of understanding, and easy entry to the border. Also, we found that prostitution was one of the orientations of interest. This is due to the fact that in general the perpetrators perceive that there are still young girls who are easily influenced due to a lack of education so that it becomes a loophole for the perpetrators to take advantage of this condition to gain profit through sexual commercialization.

4. Development of an Early Warning System in Detecting Human Trafficking Crimes

Early warning system is a form of prevention that is often used in terms of detecting natural events and in the health sector, especially in terms of nursing. The Early Warning System in its development can also be used to prevent human trafficking crimes from occurring. This concept is a brilliant breakthrough to assist the United Nations in preventing human trafficking crimes, which in this case focuses on six focus points.

As comparison for the efforts to prevent human trafficking crimes carried out in several countries that have had an impact on preventing human trafficking carried out by 90 international agencies in the Americas, Africa, Arab countries, Asia Pacific, Europe and Central Asia, it can be seen that there are 4 efforts or programs that have had an impact

---

on preventing human trafficking crimes including: supporting government programs; service and coordination; risk based services; and a combination of the three.\(^{24}\)

In particular for Ethiopia, it is known that the concept of preventing human trafficking that is applied is a non-penal approach by trying to promote entrepreneurial activity, encouraging citizens to follow legal procedures when going to work abroad, increasing public awareness with various campaigns or outreach and strengthening the region border; furthermore, several other countries implement strengthening legislation, strengthening survivors of human trafficking, and increasing monitoring and evaluation of anti-human trafficking interventions. If this approach is compared with the Early Warning System concept, some similarities will be found, namely that it can be qualified as a prevention effort with a non-penal approach, but on the other hand, the efforts made by countries in the world and especially Ethiopia besides the non-penal approach, the country also uses a penal policy approach by adopting the aspects contained in the UN Protocol into legal constructions such as the country of Ethiopia and other countries.\(^{25}\)

However, on the other hand, from the results of this comparison, several advantages will be found in the application of prevention using the Early Warning System approach to human trafficking crimes, including the first, by implementing an Early Warning System, the potential for human trafficking crimes can be detected as early as possible so that action can be taken prevention before the occurrence of a crime; Secondly, by detecting the potential for human trafficking crimes, in this case the state can take necessary actions through law enforcement officials as a manifestation of protection of citizens' rights.\(^{26}\)

In empirical framework, a crime tends to have its own characteristics and patterns that occur repeatedly both in terms of the method of execution, the motive for the action, the nature of the crime, and other aspects because basically, the birth of a crime is the result of learning. in situations that will then give birth to ways or actions that are sustainable.\(^{27}\) Therefore, to understand the character and pattern of crime requires time and continuous observation. With continuous observation, the pattern or characteristics of the crime of human trafficking will be clearer.

In this study, as a benchmark in determining signs or signals of human trafficking crimes in West Kalimantan, especially in Sambas Regency, researchers are more focused on the mode or method used by criminals. Namely in the form of facilities carried out by perpetrators of human trafficking crimes in the process of recruitment, transportation,


transfer, and other forms of exploitation obtained based on field data that has been adjusted to the formulation as referred in the Law No. 21 of 2007 regarding Eradication of Human Trafficking Crimes so as to produce the development of an objective Early Warning System.

Based on the results of the field data it can be seen that in carrying out their actions, generally the perpetrators of human trafficking crimes in Sambas Regency, West Kalimantan Province used certain methods and processes, while the methods and processes can be seen in the Table 1.

Table 1. Human trafficking methods and processes in West Kalimantan, Indonesia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recruitment stage</th>
<th>Transfer and Transportation stage</th>
<th>Realization between promise and execution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Carried out from door to door;</td>
<td>o Transfers are made on trips involving various vehicles;</td>
<td>o There is a discrepancy between previous appointments and performance at work;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Generally disguised as peddlers;</td>
<td>o During the transfer process, you are not allowed to hold communication devices such as cellphones, etc.;</td>
<td>o In general, the payment of wages is not in accordance with the previous agreement, both in terms of time of wages and nominal wages;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Work as a team;</td>
<td>o Arriving at the border guard post, the perpetrators generally tried to hide the victim.</td>
<td>o At work, workers are not allowed to communicate with their relatives through any media, both during work and when not working;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Promising a certain job;</td>
<td></td>
<td>o Harsh treatment of workers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Promises high wages;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• No matter the age of the</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prospective worker;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Willing to give some money so</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that the victim wants to work;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The process of making or</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>managing departure documents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>is generally not based on the</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>actual destination.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary data, 2022 (analysed).

As a result, the pattern of occurrence of human trafficking crimes in Sambas Regency, West Kalimantan Province, as one of the districts that have boundaries directly adjacent to Malaysia, has special characteristics for the occurrence of human trafficking. The mode of occurrence of human trafficking it can be seen that there are different modes carried out by perpetrators to recruit potential victims, either by visiting directly door to door, working by forming a team with various tasks from each team member, and facilities for giving money and departure documents for victims only made as a way that facilitates the implementation of human trafficking crimes. The completeness of the documents that were owned was not in accordance with the actual ones, either with regard to the identity or purpose of the victims’ departure. Suppose this series of things is constructed with the concept of an early warning system. In that case, it can be built from the pattern of modus operandi carried out by the perpetrators, which is then used as a reference that can assess the processes related to the occurrence of human trafficking crimes.

In the end, it will be used as an indicator of fulfilling the requirements for the occurrence of a warning building. Early response to the occurrence of human trafficking as a crime in the West Kalimantan region. The concept of Early Warning System is one of the ideal concepts for detecting the occurrence of an event, both natural events, as well as criminal events or phenomena because the Early Warning System is an early warning system that
works by obtaining a signal for an event that will then occur expressed in the form of information. Specifically, in dealing with crime phenomena, the concept of "Early Warning System" requires support from various parties in the form of involvement and sensitivity, which functions as a filter to form an early warning system so that this concept is successful.

This filter at least consists of potential victims, then agencies related to the management of departure documents, and border guard posts. In other words, if potential victims cannot detect human trafficking crimes, then what will function as a filter is the sensitivity of document management agencies, and examiner documents of community activities that can support or become channels of human trafficking. As for the form of a filter that can be used as an early warning that can be accumulated for the occurrence of human trafficking crimes in border communities of West Kalimantan, Indonesia, among others:

a. The occurrence of departure of minors abroad without being accompanied by the main family or identity falsification;
b. Hotel registration activities without valid documents for staying in one room (can be in the form of: marriage documents) by two people of different sexes;
c. Occurrence of job offers or lures from parties that are unclear and/or do not have a valid corporate identity according to law with high salaries or income;
d. Activities abroad through unofficial channels and do not have permits for departure documents that have been determined by law or departure documents are not in accordance with the actual destination;
e. Providing facilities and/or money by employers during the departure process and prohibiting the use of telecommunication equipment for prospective workers as potential victims.

The existence of the five points above can be used as a reference or indicator by related parties in anticipating the occurrence of a criminal act of human trafficking, which is called the "Early Warning System". the last filter is the border guard post, therefore in this case as the final filter system, border guard officers are required to have extra insight and extra sensitivity in detecting the occurrence of human trafficking crimes, because if at this last filter stage, they cannot detect the occurrence of Human trafficking crimes, it can be ensured that human trafficking crimes as criminal acts will run smoothly and again cause victims.

5. Conclusion

Early warning system in preventing human trafficking crimes, among others, look at the existing modes at the stage where the crime was committed, the means used to support unlawful acts of human trafficking, and the purpose or form exploitation. Hence, each existing stage is a system that is related to one another, which is built into five forms of early warning. The occurrence of departure of minors abroad without being accompanied by their families; Hotel registration activities without valid documents for staying in one room by two people of different sex; Occurrence of job offers from parties that are unclear or do not have a valid company; Activities abroad through unofficial channels and do not have permission for departure documents that have been determined. Each of
which mutually supports the occurrence of human trafficking crimes that require prevention from the start.

To conduct the due process of law towards cases related with human trafficking, the law enforcement officers cannot work by themselves. They really need assistance from many parties, such as active report from the society as a valuable information to disclose such cases. As a result, there are still limitations, especially in the form of strengthening shared perceptions of policy formulations that can be used to implement the construction of early warning against the occurrence of human trafficking crimes in border areas. The existing law to the occurrence of human trafficking crimes in the West Kalimantan region it still raises differences in perceptions of human trafficking. It can have an impact on building the concept that has been raised for preventing the occurrence of human trafficking crimes in the border areas.

References


